



## **Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**

### **Plans Review Subcommittee**

Thursday, April 22, 2010

### **LEGAL ACTION REPORT**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:05 p.m.

Commissioners: Teresita Majewski (Chair), Kathy Nabours, Patsy Waterfall, Demion Clinco, Bill Mackey, Sharon Chadwick, Gal Witmer

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku, Jonathan Mabry, Aline Torres, Kevin McIlheny

2. Regular Cases:

HPZ 10-17 City of Tucson/Parks & Recreation Department-Catalina Park-Rehabilitation; 941 North 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue (Reconsideration) (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Kevin McIlheny, COT, Parks & Recreation Department, assisted by Walt Rogers, Landscape Architect, on the proposed improvements to Catalina Park, located in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. Commissioner Witmer remains recused from discussion/voting on this case.

This presentation was a response to the input given to the project team at the last plans review meeting held on April 8, 2010. The proposed shade structure (ramada) was reduced in area as requested. The playground area was reduced by a total of 39%. The viewsheds was enhanced and the utility room was screened with additional landscaping. All colors for the project were compatible with surrounding residences in this development zone (Off-white/light tan and pale orange/pale green). More shade trees were added to the inside ring of the recreation area. The pump house could not be reduced because it would compromise facility management. Placing pump house facilities underground was cost prohibitive. A pergola shade structure in lieu of the ramada did not match existing structures and would create a false sense of history as well as a maintenance issue. The massing of the ramada was reduced and the height was lowered 1 ½'-2' which meets current safety standards. Concrete walkways are more durable and less maintenance intensive than decomposed granite. Historic lighting fixtures are cost prohibitive and susceptible to vandalism and standard light fixtures will be recessed into the masonry columns of the ramada (this was reviewed and recommended for approval by the West University Neighborhood Association and the West University Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board. An option to install asphalt shingles (architectural tab) and the proposed lightweight clay tile would be acceptable. The shower must have a cover as required by Pima County Health Department.

After presentation of all the design elements requested by the commissioners to be addressed, Jonathan Mabry, City of Tucson, Historic Program Manager stated that the revised plan as presented is a "good faith" interpretation of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for rehabilitation of the park.

Chair Majewski addressed each commissioner's concerns. Commissioner Waterfall stated the colors as presented were a "good selection" and that more trees in addition to the two (2) trees on the east side and two (2) trees on the north side as shown on the revised plan could be added at a later date. Commissioner Nabours stated the reduced area of the ramada "looks good" and does not overwhelm the recreation area. Asphalt shingles as presented could be installed as an option if preferred by the project team. The pump house appearance is acceptable. Commissioner Nabours stated that different species of trees should be installed rather than the same species to provide more variety. The roof on the shower area was consistent with the other roofs on the other structures. Commissioner Clinco stated his concern for the mass of the ramada even in its reduced configuration. Commissioner Chadwick stated that the symmetry was not addressed in the presentation of the revised plan.

Chair Majewski stated the project team was trying to work within its budget and the proposal received recommendations to proceed from other stakeholders in the West University neighborhood. The complete project may not be installed; specifically, the concrete sidewalks-- due to the budget. Decomposed granite may have to be used until other funding sources become available in the future. Chair Majewski stated the neighborhood should remain involved in all future improvements including a master plan for future plantings of vegetation.

Chair Majewski requested comments from others present but not to address site specifics other than what has already been presented/discussed. Noah Sensibar, Co-chair, West University Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board (WUHPZAB), stated the lot coverage for the project is consistent with the development zone, the color palate was acceptable and the tree planting plan was not considered at the WUHPZAB meeting. Barbara Macri, member of the WUHPZAB, stated the fabric cloth was not an acceptable option as shown on a previous plan and that all structures should match in materials and roof coverings whenever possible. Chris Gans, Chair, West University Neighborhood Association (WUNA), stated that a parks subcommittee was formed by the WUNA organization for the express purpose of reviewing this plan. Design #2, which was presented to the commissioners on April 8, was recommended for approval and reflects closely the plan initiated nearly four years ago.

Eric Means, neighbor, across from Catalina Park, stated the ramada appeared to be too massive even in its reduced size. The pergola design appeared to be more open. Kevin McIlhaney stated a public safety issue with a pergola design would prompt children to use the pergola as "monkey bars" and create liability issues for the city.

Motion by Commissioner Nabours to recommend approval of the final revised plan with the following conditions: 1) Trees under the existing tree canopy be omitted at the discretion of the landscape architect for the project, and; 2) All roof structures be the same material (either lightweight concrete tile or asphalt shingle).

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Commissioner Clinco stated the revised plan only adds six (6) trees and the reduction of the ramada was not adequate. He stated the balance and rhythm of the circular area were not addressed in the revised plan. Commissioner Mackey stated the project team did not incorporate the original vocabulary of the park into the improvements as presented and the circular area of the plan was not in keeping with the integrity of the original plan for the park.

Motion by Commissioner Nabours passed 3-2. Chair Majewski did not vote.

Commissioner Witmer left the meeting at 2:26 p.m.

.....

HPZ 10-21 Sassenberger-Rear Porch (Rebuild Fire Damage); 230 East 16<sup>th</sup> Street (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Jose Ceja, project manager, on the rebuild of the rear portion of an existing single-family residence located in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone. All elements including wood windows/doors and rear porch will be restored to their original appearance/configuration. The original brick will be cleaned to remove fire/smoke damage.

Motion by Patsy Waterfall to recommend approval as presented.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

### 3. Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone:

RND 10-04 Beowulf Alley Theatre Company-Façade Improvement/Sign; 11 South 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

Presentation by Bob Vint, Architect, on the proposed façade improvement of the 1918 storefront. Jonathan Mabry reported to the commissioners that the State Historic Preservation Office review revealed an issue with the marquee. State Historic Preservation Officer, Jim Garrison, concluded the marquee location and design would not mitigate the importance of the front façade if a seam was provided between it and the front façade. A determination on eligibility for inclusion in the National Register of Historic Places could not be made but the plan should proceed as if it was eligible due to the disappearance over the decades of the original façade. The proposal as presented was not in conflict with the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

The proposal included dual glazed glass topped with an opal infused glass block. This was the former location of Johnny Gibson's exercise equipment store after the Western Auto Service Company occupied the location. Windows will be aluminum framed as will be the marquee. A fine sand stucco finish will be applied with gray paint. The result will be a "Steamlined Deco Modern" style in appearance.

Motion by Bill Mackey to recommend approval as submitted.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

RND 10-05 Zen Rock-Façade Improvement/Sign; 121 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

Presentation by Bob Vint, Architect, on the façade improvements for the business known as “Zen Rock” located on the north side of East Congress Street in the Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone. Beneath the existing stucco are angle iron trusses and a brick parapet. The building was constructed in the late 1890’s and eventually became a Piggly Wiggly grocery store in the 1930’s. In the 1920’s, fabric awnings began to appear on the storefronts of buildings along downtown corridors. This proposal includes the installation of a solid red awning that will serve to unify all historic periods of the building. The existing black ceramic tile and floor tile at the front entryway will be maintained. This proposal was classified as a combination restoration/rehabilitation according to Jonathan Mabry. The historic transoms will remain and larger black tile (42”) will be installed to differentiate the old and the new.

Motion by Patsy Waterfall to recommend approval as presented.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 5-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

.....

4. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:

- a. Minor Reviews: HPZ 10-19 Roth-Fences/Gates/Accessory Structure; 1031/1035 North 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone)  
HPZ 10-20 Murphy-Wall/Gate/Front Porch Cover/Stucco/Paint; 637 North 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone)
- b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
- c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in historic preservation zones are reported to the Code Enforcement section of Community Services Department (792-CITY) and a city inspector is assigned to the case. If a zoning violation is confirmed, the property owner has the opportunity to abate the violation through the historic review/approval process as delineated in Sec. 2.8.8. of the City of Tucson Land Use Code.
- d. Historic Preservation Zone Development Standards: Jonathan Mabry reported the originally scheduled meeting with the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board for training on historic reviews has been postponed until June, 2010.

5. Call to the Audience: Richard Mayers, member, West University Neighborhood Association stated that the neighbors surrounding the park were able to become involved in the review/recommendation process when the plan was first presented to

WUNA but decided to lobby separately before both neighborhood boards and the plans review subcommittee to provide input into the process.

6. Meeting adjourned at 3:20 p.m.